The following report is submitted on behalf of Romania in accordance with decision I/8 and II/10

Name of officer responsible for submitting the national report:	Constantin Pulbere
Signature:	
Date:	

IMPLEMENTATION REPORT

Party	Romania
National Focal Point	
Full name of the institution:	Ministry of Environment and Forest
Name and title of officer:	Constantin Pulbere, legal adviser, EIA Office
Postal address:	12 th Libertății Blvd., sector 5, Bucharest
Telephone:	004 021 3166154
Fax:	004 021 3160421
E-mail:	constantin.pulbere@mmediu.ro
Contact officer for national report (if different): N/A	
Full name of the institution:	
Name and title of officer:	
Postal address:	
Telephone:	
Fax:	
E-mail:	

I. PROCESS BY WHICH THE REPORT HAS BEEN PREPARED

1. Provide brief information on the process by which this report has been prepared, including information on which types of public authorities were consulted or contributed to its preparation, on how the public was consulted and how the outcome of the public consultation was taken into account and on the material which was used as a basis for preparing the report.

The Implementation Report was completed by the Ministry of Environment and Forests (MEF) and the National Environmental Protection Agency (NEPA).

The report was available on the web pages of MEF and NEPA. No comments were received from the public.

II. PARTICULAR CIRCUMSTANCES RELEVANT FOR UNDERSTANDING THE REPORT

2. Report any particular circumstances that are relevant for understanding the report, e.g. whether there is a federal and/or decentralized decision-making structure, whether the provisions of the Convention have a direct effect upon its entry into force, or whether financial constraints are a significant obstacle to implementation (optional).

Romania is a unitary state. The public administration within administrative - territorial units is based on decentralized local autonomy.

Romania signed the Aarhus Convention on 25 June 1998 and ratified it by *Law no. 86/2000* on 11 July 2000.

According to article 11, paragraphs 2 of the Romanian Constitution, the ratified treaties are part of national law. Consequently, the provisions of the Convention have a direct effect upon its entry into force. It must be underlined that the transposition of the EU legislation in this field (Directive 2003/4/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council on public access to environmental information and repealing Council Directive 90/313/EEC and Directive 2003/35/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council providing for public participation in respect of the drawing up of certain plans and programmes relating to the environment and amending with regard to public participation and access to justice Council Directives 85/337/EEC and 96/61/EC) also facilitated the implementation of this Convention.

According to article 20 of the Romanian Constitution, as amended, the Constitutional provisions on the Romanian citizens' rights and freedoms are applied in compliance with the Universal Declaration on Human Rights and with all the other treaties to which Romania is a Party. The ratified treaties on fundamental human rights prevail when there is a disagreement between these treaties and the national legislation, except in cases when the Romanian Constitution and laws contain more favorable provisions.

Government Emergency Ordinance (GEO) 195/2005 on environmental protection approved by Law 265/2006, as amended – the framework law on environmental protection - provides for principles, such as access to environmental information, public participation to environmental decision making process and access to justice.

Based on the provisions of the same law, the local and central public authorities ensure the public information and participation to the decision-making process, in compliance with the Aarhus Convention.

Access to justice is also ensured by Law no.554/2004 on administrative contentious, as amended.

Governmental Decision (GD) 878/2005 on public access to environmental information has an important role in establishing the institutional framework for the application of the Convention into the national law. Each local and central public authority has set up an office in charge of providing and disseminating environmental information.

III. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY AND OTHER MEASURES IMPLEMENTING THE GENERAL PROVISIONS IN PARAGRAPHS 2, 3, 4, 7 AND 8 OF ARTICLE 3

3. Explain how these paragraphs have been implemented. In particular, describe: (a) With respect to paragraph 2, measures taken to ensure that officials and authorities assist and provide the required guidance;

The basic principles provided for by Government Emergency Ordinance (GEO) 195/2005 approved by Law 265/2006 are implemented by the subsequent legislation.

The subsequent legislation (ex. strategic environmental assessment (SEA), environmental impact assessment (EIA), permitting, etc.) lays down methodologies to ensure the access to

environmental information, public participation in the decision-making and access to justice in environmental matters.

GD 878/2005 on public access to environmental information, and Ministerial Order (MO) 1182/2002 for the approval of the managing and providing methodology on environmental information provide the framework for accomplishing the responsibilities mentioned above. The public authorities must assist the public in seeking access to environmental information by establishing lists and registers with environmental information.

All of the environmental public authorities (Ministry of Environment and Forests - MEF, National Environment Protection Agency - NEPA, Regional Environment Protection Agencies - REPA, Local Environment Protection Agencies - LEPA) have WebPages where environmental information is made available for the public and updated periodically. In the WebPages mentioned one can found, inter alia, texts of the international acts where Romania is a party and the relevant national legislation, as well as contact dates for sending request by the public.

Public participation during the elaboration process of regulation is done in compliance with Law no. 52/2003 on decisional transparency in public administration. Drafts of normative acts, regulatory acts and decisions are published on the authorities' websites, ensuring an active public participation. The environmental authorities organize monthly or on specific cases, public conferences with wide mass-media access, in order to inform on the latest information in the environmental protection field.

In 2010, the Aarhus Center – Romania has been established through a Memorandum between NEOA, Ecological University and Romanian Environment Association. Within this framework, representatives from the environmental authorities, NGOs and civil society can collaborate in order to implement the Aarhus Convention. The tasks of the Centre will include:

- To ensure the clearing-house mechanism (gathering, certification, dissemination and exchange of information on environment) by creating a webpage on the Aarhus Convention Implementation at national level;
- To monitor issues, such as: the quality degree of the events available for the public, environmental impact assessment, issues of compliance with the environmental legislation:
- To organize workshops with various target groups in order to debate on draft of environmental laws, in order to send clear comments for the public authorities;
- To organize training for the environmental legislation for various group targets (NGOs, mass-media, wide public).

During 2010, a centralized review of the environmental authorities' websites has taken place. Thus, in the same structure all the relevant information has been put in a portal for NEPA, REPAs and LEPAs. This review aimed a better and easier way of accessing the relevant information by the public.

(b) With respect to paragraph 3, measures taken to promote education and environmental awareness;

Government Emergency Ordinance (GEO) 195/2005 approved by Law 265/2006 contains several provisions on this issue:

- Article 4, letter p) provides for environmental education and environmental awareness among the public and public participation in decision-making regarding environmental matters;
- Article 74, letter n) sets the right of the regional NGO representative to be member in the Regional Committee for environmental protection, established at every REPA.

- Article 75, letter n) establishes that the central public authority ensures the implementation and elaboration of programs and the elaboration of educational publications concerning environmental protection.
- Article 85 provides for the central public authority for education and research to ensure the following:
 - ➤ The adaptation of educational plans and programs at all levels, for assimilating the notions and principles of environmental protection (letter a).
 - ➤ Promotion of studies and research programmes corresponding to the priorities established by the central environmental protection authority (letter b).
 - ➤ Elaboration of educational programms aiming to a responsible environmental behavior (letter c)

The process of public information and education consists of:

- Publication of guidelines;
- Ecological education at all levels;
- Collaboration between Local Environmental Protection Agencies, NGOs and the local public administration in developing environmental projects;
- Establishing in each LEPA, REPA an information office;
- Publishing periodical reports on the state of the environment (EPA);
- Environmental/ecological curricula in elementary and high-schools further developed in certain universities established in the field of environmental protection.
- Special ecological education programs in some schools "eco-schools"

The Ministry for Education and Research has included in the educational curriculum at the gymnasium level a course for ecology.

At higher levels, ecology and environmental protection are studied in public educational institutions such as, for example:

- The high-school for environmental protection in Cluj-Napoca;
- The technical college for construction and environmental protection in Arad;
- University of Oradea: Faculty for Environmental Protection;
- University of Bucharest: Specialization in Ecology and Environmental Protection at Faculty of Biology;

There are also private institutions such as, for example: The High-school for Ecology in Bucharest and University for Ecology in Bucharest.

Based on Law no. 52/2003 on the transparency of the decision-making process within public administration, the public has the right to express comments and opinions on the drafts of normative acts and consequently, it is better informed and more aware on laws and regulations.

(c) With respect to paragraph 4, measures taken to ensure that there is appropriate recognition of and support to associations, organizations or groups promoting environmental protection;

Romania's Constitution guarantees the following:

- Article 30, freedom of expression
- Article 31, the right on information
- Article 40, the right of association

Government Emergency Ordinance (GEO) 195/2005 approved by Law 265/2006 provides for the following:

the right of any person to take part in an environmental organization (art. 5, letter b));

- the right of any person to address directly or through environmental organizations to the administrative authorities and/or the courts of law, regarding environmental problems, regardless if there was or was not a prejudice (art. 5, letter d));
- the access to justice in environmental matters for the NGOs (art.20 (6));
- the consultation of NGO, at least once a year, by the environmental central public authority for establishing environmental protection strategy (art. 75, letter t)).

The Government Ordinance no. 26/2000 on associations and foundations as amended by Government Ordinance no. 37/2003 establishes the national legal framework for recognition of NGOs.

On the MEF and NEPA WebPages the public can found all the necessary information in order to contact the NGO registered at the Ministry of Justice as being active in the environmental protection field, including: name of the NGO and manager, address, phone number, fax number, e-mail and webpage.

- (d) With respect to paragraph 7, measures taken to promote the principles of the Convention internationally;
- (e) With respect to paragraph 8, measures taken to ensure that persons exercising their rights under the Convention are not to be penalized, persecuted or harassed.

Article 30 (para. 1-6) of Romanian Constitution, as amended, guarantees the freedom of expression, of opinions by means of communication. Any censorship shall be prohibited. A person exercising the rights provided by the Aarhus Convention cannot be penalized, persecuted or harassed.

Romania's Constitution, as amended, guarantees in article 31 that "a person's right of access to any information of public interest shall not be restricted" (par. 1), and "the public authorities, according to their competence shall be bound to provide correct information to the citizens in public affairs and matters of personal interest" (para. 2)

In applying the provisions of article 12 letter (f) of GD 878/2005 (where a public authority may refuse a request for environmental information if the disclosure of the information would affect the confidentiality of personal data and/or files relating to a natural person where that person has not consented to the disclosure of the information to the public, where such confidentiality is provided for by national or Community law in force), public authorities take into consideration the provisions of Law 677/2001 on the protection of persons regarding processing data with personal character and the free circulation of those data.

Romania is also a party to the European Human Rights Convention and therefore recognizes the jurisdiction of the European Court for Human Rights.

IV. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 3

4. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of any of the paragraphs of article 3 listed above.

Obstacles:

- the fluctuation of the personnel responsible with environmental information;
- insufficient personnel responsible with administrating the web pages;
- insufficient personnel with juridical training within the environmental authorities;
- lack of financial resources, in case of art.3 par. 3.

V. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE GENERAL PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 3

5. Provide further information on the practical application of the general provisions of the Convention.

The practical application of the general provisions is ensured by the implementation of the following pieces of legislation:

- EGO no.195/2005 on environmental protection approved by Law.no265/2006, as amended:
- Law no.544/2001 on access to public information
- GD no.878/2005 on access to environmental information;
- GD no.445/2009 on establishing the framework for environmental impact assessment for certain public and private projects;
- GD no.1076/2004 on environmental assessment for plans and programmes;
- GD no. 564/2006 on the framework of public participation in elaborating certain plans and programmes related to the environment;
- Law no.554/2001 on administrative contentious:
- Subsequent legislation;

GD 878/2005 on public access to environmental information was adopted on the grounds of the Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters, signed at Aarhus, on June 25th, 1998, ratified by Law no 86/2000. According with art.1 and art.2 the GD878/2005 guarantees the right of access to environmental information held by or for public authorities and sets out the conditions, basic terms and practical arrangements for its exercise. The environmental information is progressively made available and disseminated to the public in order to achieve the widest possible systematic availability and dissemination of this information. To this end, the use, in particular, of the electronic technology and/or of computer communication, shall be promoted. Romania is the signatory of the Political Declaration on Electronic Governance implementation approved by the ministries of the member and candidate states on 30 November 2001 at Brussels. Following this declaration, the signatory countries approved the realization of a European electronic portal which can ensure the access of every European citizen to basic public services. The Romanian National Electronic System, available on Internet at the address www.e-guvernare.ro, was developed in order to facilitate the interaction of the citizens and business environment to the public administration by offering information and online services.

Electronic governance is defined within the GD no. 1440/2002 concerning the approval of the national strategy on the promotion of new economy and implementation of the information society. "e-Government" represents the electronic offer of public services for citizens and the business environment together with the availability of public information on the Internet around the clock. The WebPages of ministries, including the webpage of the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development facilitates the direct access to public information. According to the GD no.1007/2001, as regards to the interaction between the citizen and the local public administration, the "e-Administration" strategy concerning the information of the public administration was approved as part of the component related to the information exchange between citizens and government.

VI. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 3

6. Give relevant website addresses, if available:

Ministry of Environment and Forests (MEF): www.mmediu.ro;

National Agency for Environmental Protection: www.anpm.ro Romanian Government: www.gov.ro

LEPA/REPA	WEBPAGE
APM Alba	www.apmab.anpm.ro
APM Arad	www.apmar.anpm.ro
APM Bihor	www.apmbh.anpm.ro
APM Bistrita-Nasaud	www.apmbn.anpm.ro
APM Braila	www.apmbr.anpm.ro
APM Botosani	www.apmbt.anpm.ro
APM Brasov	www.apmbv.anpm.ro
APM Buzau	www.apmbz.anpm.ro
APM Calarasi	www.apmcl.anpm.ro
APM Caras-Severin	www.apmcs.anpm.ro
APM Constanta	www.apmct.anpm.ro
APM Covasna	www.apmcv.anpm.ro
APM Dambovita	www.apmdb.anpm.ro
APM Gorj	www.apmgj.anpm.ro
APM Giurgiu	www.apmgr.anpm.ro
APM Hunedoara	www.apmhd.anpm.ro
APM Harghita	www.apmhr.anpm.ro
APM IIfov	www.apmif.anpm.ro
APM lalomita	www.apmil.anpm.ro
APM lasi	www.apmis.anpm.ro
APM Mehedinti	www.apmmh.anpm.ro
APM Maramures	www.apmmm.anpm.ro
APM Mures	www.apmms.anpm.ro
APM Neamt	www.apmnt.anpm.ro
APM OIt	www.apmot.anpm.ro
APM Prahova	www.apmph.anpm.ro
APM Salaj	www.apmsj.anpm.ro
APM Satu-Mare	www.apmsm.anpm.ro
APM Suceava	www.apmsv.anpm.ro
APM Tulcea	www.apmtl.anpm.ro
APM Teleorman	www.apmtr.anpm.ro
APM Valcea	www.apmvl.anpm.ro
APM Vrancea	www.apmvn.anpm.ro
APM Vaslui	www.apmvs.anpm.ro
ARPM PITESTI	www.arpmag.anpm.ro
ARPM BACAU	www.arpmbc.anpm.ro
	Maria Crombia Conno ro
ARPM BUCURESTI	www.arpmbuc.anpm.ro
ARPM CLUJ-NAPOCA	www.arpmouc.anpm.ro www.arpmcj.anpm.ro
ARPM CLUJ-NAPOCA ARPM CRAIOVA	
ARPM CLUJ-NAPOCA ARPM CRAIOVA ARPM GALATI	www.arpmcj.anpm.ro
ARPM CLUJ-NAPOCA ARPM CRAIOVA	www.arpmcj.anpm.ro www.arpmdj.anpm.ro

VII. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY AND OTHER MEASURES IMPLEMENTING THE PROVISIONS ON ACCESS TO ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION IN ARTICLE 4

7. Explain how each paragraph of article 4 has been implemented. Describe the transposition of the relevant definitions in article 2 and the non-discrimination requirement in article 3, paragraph 9.

GD no. 878/2005 art.1(1) on the public access to environmental information "ensures the public right of access to environmental information held by or for public authorities and sets out the basis and the ways to exert this right".

MO no. 1182/2002 sets out the methodology for the active and passive flow of environmental information for environmental authorities.

The GD no.878/2005 as the special normative act on access to environmental information is complementary with the provisions of Law no.544/2001 which mentions in art.15 that the access of the mass-media to the public information is guaranteed and the activity to gather and release public information by the mass-media is a concrete way of the citizens rights to have access to any public information. The public authorities are obliged to organize press conferences periodically, but usually once per month, in order to disseminate public information.

As mentioned above, the Aarhus Convention became part of the national law as a result of its ratification. Consequently, article 2 and 3, paragraph 9, applies accordingly.

Government Emergency Ordinance (GEO) 195/2005 approved by Law 265/2006 stipulates that environmental protection authorities guarantees the access to information, public participation in decision-making and access to justice in environmental matters according to Aarhus Convention, ratified by Law 86/2002.

Article 2 of GD 878/2005 provides definitions for "environmental information", "public authorities", "information held by public authority", "information held for a public authority", "the applicant" and "public".

The non-discrimination requirement was included in the definition of "the applicant" in art.2 of the GD 878/2005.

Also, and in particular, describe:

- (a) With respect to paragraph 1, measures taken to ensure that:
- (i) Any person may have access to information without having to state an interest;

Art.3 (3) of GD no. 878/2005 stipulates that "The public authorities are required to make available the environmental information held by or for them to any applicant, at his request and without him having to state an interest".

According with the provision of Law no.544/2001 on free access to public information, an applicant has to mention his/her name, in order to receive an answer a request has to include: the applicant's name, surname, signature and the address which the answer will be send to. The request can be send (art.7 (3) of Law no.544/2001) also electronically.

- (ii) Copies of the actual documentation containing or comprising the requested information are supplied;
- (iii) The information is supplied in the form requested;

Art.6 (1) of GD no. 878/2005 provides for "When an applicant requests a public authority to make available the environmental information in a specific from or format, including copies, the public authority shall make it so available unless:

- o it is already publicly available, according to articles 20 − 25, in another form or format which is easily accessible by applicants, or
- it is reasonable for the public authority to make it available in another form or format, in which case reasons shall be given for making it available in that form or format".

(b) Measures taken to ensure that the time limits provided for in paragraph 2 are respected;

Art.4 of GD no. 878/2005 stipulates that "the environmental information is made available to the applicant as soon as possible or at the latest within one month after the receipt of request". The same article provides that the authority has to respond to a request for information within a month after the registration of the request, except (for the cases) when the amount or complexity of the requested information requires a two months period. In such cases, the applicant is informed, as soon as possible, and at the latest before the end of the one month timeframe, about the extension of the response timeframe and the reasons on which this extension is grounded.

(c) With respect to paragraphs 3 and 4, measures taken to:

(i) Provide for exemptions from requests;

The legal framework for the exemptions from providing information of public interest is set by the *Law 544/2001 on access to public information* and the GD 878/2005 on access to environmental information:

Art.12 of Law no.544/2001 provides that the following information shall be excepted from the free access of the citizens:

- a. The information in the field of national defense, public safety and order, if they belong to the category of classified information, according to the law;
- b. the information on the deliberations of the authorities, as well as those that concern the economic and political interests of Romania, if they belong to the category of classified information, according to the law;
- c. the information regarding the commercial and financial information, if their publicity is prejudicial to the intellectual or industrial property right, as well as to the principle of loyal competition, according to the law;
- d. Information with regard to the personal data, according to the law;
- e. the information regarding the proceedings during the criminal or disciplinary investigation, if the results of investigation are put at risk, the confidential sources are disclosed or the life, bodily integrity, health of a person are endangered as a consequence of the investigation completed or in progress;
- f. the information regarding the judicial proceedings, if their publicity could be prejudicial to a fair trial or to the legitimate interest of any of the parties to the lawsuit;
- g. The information the publication of which is prejudicial to the measures for the protection of youth.

The information that indulges or conceals the violation of the law by a public authority or institution may not be included in the category of classified information and shall represent public information.

GD no. 878/2005, article 11(1) stipulates:

- Public authorities may refuse a request for environmental information if:
 - a. the required information is not held by the public authority to which the request is addressed. In that case, if the public authority to which the request was addressed is aware that the information is held by another public authority, it transfers the request to that other authority, as soon as possible, but not later than 15 days, and informs the applicant accordingly;
 - b. the request is manifestly unreasonable;
 - c. (c) the request is formulated in too general a manner, considering the dispositions of art.5:
 - d. the request concerns material in the course of completion, unfinished data or documents;

e. the request concerns internal communications, taking into account the public interest served by disclosure.

Also, article 12 (1) of GD 878/2005 establishes the special situations when a request of environmental information can be denied. Those situations are the same with the ones mentioned in article 4 par. 4 letter a)-h) from Aarhus Convention.

In every particular case, the public interest served by disclosure shall be weighed against the interest served by the maintaining of the confidentiality (art.13 (3) of GD 878/2005).

The grounds for a refusal shall be interpreted in a restrictive way, taking into account for every particular case, the public interest served by disclosure (art.13 (2) of GD 878/2005).

(ii) Ensure that the public interest at the end of paragraph 4 is applied;

In order to give effect to the public interest, the Romanian legislation stipulates that the reasons for refusal of a request must be interpreted in a restrictive way, taking into account in each case the public interest served by disclosure (art.12, para. 2 of the GD no. 878/2005). The public authorities may not, by virtue of par. 1 letters (a), (d), (f), (g) and (h) from the GD 878/2005, provide for a request to be refused where the request relates to information on emissions into the environment. This applies to:

- a) the confidentiality of the proceedings of public authorities, where such confidentiality is provided by the legislation in force;
- d) the confidentiality of commercial or industrial information where such confidentiality is provided for by national or Community law in force to protect a legitimate economic interest, including the public interest in maintaining statistical confidentiality and tax secrecy;
- f) the confidentiality of personal data and/or files relating to a natural person where that person has not consented to the disclosure of the information to the public, where such confidentiality is provided for by national or Community law in force;
- g) the interests or protection of any person who supplied the information requested on a voluntary basis without being under, or capable of being put under, a legal obligation to do so, unless that person has consented to the release of the information concerned;
- h) the protection of the environment to which such information relates, such as the location of rare species.

(d) With respect to paragraph 5, measures taken to ensure that a public authority that does not hold the environmental information requested takes the necessary action;

In the GD no. 878/2005, article 11(1), letter (a) requires that if the public authority to which the request was addressed is aware that the information is held by another public authority, it transfers the request to that other authority, as soon as possible, but not later than 15 days, and inform the applicant accordingly.

Article 7 of GD no. 878/2005 provides for all public authorities to keep public registers containing the types of environmental information held by them.

(e) With respect to paragraph 6, measures taken to ensure that the requirement to separate out and make available information is implemented;

Article 15(1) of GD no. 878/2005 states: "The environmental information held by or for public authorities, which has been requested by an applicant, shall be made available in part where it is possible to separate out any information falling within the scope of article 11(1), letters d) and e) or article 12(1), from the rest of the information requested".

(f) With respect to paragraph 7, measures taken to ensure that refusals meet the time limits and the other requirements with respect to refusals;

According to the provisions of article 15(2) and (3) of GD no. 878/2005, a motivated refusal to make available the requested information, entirely or in part, shall be notified to the applicant within a month after the registration of the request, except for the cases when the complexity of information requires a longer period - two months.

(g) With respect to paragraph 8, measures taken to ensure that the requirements on charging are met.

In accordance with art. 29 of GD 878/2005 on public access to environmental information the public has free access to any list or public register and can consult this information in situ.

The environmental authorities do not request any fees in order to provide the relevant information.

VIII. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 4

8. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of any of the paragraphs of article 4.

Whenever it comes to the issue of the confidentiality of commercial and financial data, it is difficult to decide and to balance, in each case, between the public interest and the private interest.

IX. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 4

9. Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on access to information, e.g. are there any statistics available on the number of requests made, the number of refusals and their reasons?

Each environmental protection agency has a public relations department and registers for recording the requests made, the method and term for solving it.

The National Environmental Protection Agency makes the *monthly report at national level* for the environmental information requests, based on the reports received from the territorial environmental protection agencies. This report is posted on the NEPA's webpage.

Each Local Environmental Protection Agency and Regional Environmental Protection Agency has its own statistics on the number of requests received, the number of refusals and the reasons. Also, each territorial environmental agency has on his own web page a link to NEPA's webpage (www.anpm.ro).

In 2007 there were a number of 7885 requests for public information on environment in which a number of 7804 were solved.

34.608 information requests have been submitted between the intervals 2008-2009, as follows:

- 2008: 17.193;

- 2009: 17.415

All requests have been accepted. Main issues concerned were:

- Environmental factors status: air, water, soil, biodiversity;
- Activities with potential impact on the environmental factors: waste management, energy production, raised level of noise activities, chemical substances management;
- Environmental pollution effect on public health;
- Legislative measures, plans, projects;

- Regulatory acts issued.

X. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 4

10. Give relevant web site addresses, if available: WebPages of environmental authorities

XI. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY AND OTHER MEASURES IMPLEMENTING THE PROVISIONS ON THE COLLECTION AND DISSEMINATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION IN ARTICLE 5

11. Explain how each paragraph of article 5 has been implemented. Describe the transposition of the relevant definitions in article 2 and the non-discrimination requirement in article 3, paragraph 9. Also, and in particular, describe:

GD 878/2005 ensures through Chapters 5 and 6 methods for gathering and disseminating the environmental information.

The relevant definitions are provided for by article 2 of GD 878/2005 on public access to environmental information.

The non-discrimination requirement was included in the definition of "the applicant" in art. 2 of GD 878/2005.

- (a) With respect to paragraph 1, measures taken to ensure that:
- (i) Public authorities possess and update environmental information;

Article 28(1) of GD no. 878/2005 provides for the public authorities to ensure, "as far as is within their power, that any environmental information that is compiled by them or on their behalf is up to date, accurate and comparable".

(ii) There is an adequate flow of information to public authorities;

Section 2 of MO 1182/2002 – *Active Flow of Environmental Information* – sets out the requirements for ensuring an effective flow of information at every level of environmental authorities. Regarding this issue, the environmental authorities have to perform the following tasks:

- To compile, in an accurate and timely manner, the environmental information consisting of reports, registers etc., to submit this information in electronic form to the central public authority for environmental protection and to make it available on the Internet;
- To submit the forms to be filled in to other public authorities holding environmental information and to gather and compile the responses;
- To disseminate the regulations and procedures regarding the information management to other authorities with environmental responsibilities.

(iii) In emergencies, appropriate information is disseminated immediately and without delay;

Article 24 of GD no. 878/2005 contains provisions for emergency situations:

"In the event of an imminent threat to human health or the environment, whether caused by human activities or due to natural causes, the public authorities shall disseminate the information held by or for them which could enable the public likely to be affected to undertake measures to prevent or mitigate harm arising from the threat, immediately and without delay."

(b) With respect to paragraph 2, measures taken to ensure that the way in which public authorities make environmental information available to the public is transparent and that environmental information is effectively accessible;

According to article 7(1) of GD 878/2005, "in order to facilitate the access of any person to environmental information, public authorities are required to support the public in seeking access to information and to ensure public access to the lists with public authorities holding environmental information." The same GD contains provisions regarding practical arrangements to ensure that the right of access to environmental information can be effectively exercised.

These arrangements include:

- the designation of information officers,
- the establishment of facilities for the study of the information required and
- Registers or lists of the environmental information held by public authorities or establishing information points with clear information on where such information can be found.

According to article 8 of GD 878/2005, the public authorities must inform the public about the rights provided for by this normative act, must guide and support the public, as follows:

- displaying on their WebPages the public rights;
- availability of leaflets on public rights.

In 2006 and 2007 leaflets with information regarding public rights were realized. Those materials were distributed to the territorial environmental protection agencies and posted on their WebPages.

(c) With respect to paragraph 3, measures taken to ensure that environmental information progressively becomes available in electronic databases which are easily accessible to the public through public telecommunications networks;

Art. 20 (1) of GD 878/2005 stipulates that "public authorities must organize the dissemination of environmental information and the information regarding their activities by using computerized telecommunications and/or electronic technologies". The paragraph 2 of the same article provides for the environmental information to become "available in electronic databases, easily accessible to the public through public communication networks".

Based on the above mentioned provisions a database for environmental information at national and regional level was established.

The structure of the database is as follows:

- national legislation, on the environment or relating to it;
- EU legislation on the environment or relating to it:
- international treaties, conventions and agreements;
- strategies and policies relating to the environment;
- plans and programmes relating to the environment;
- the reports
- data or summaries of data derived from the monitoring of activities affecting, or likely to affect, the environment;
- permits, agreements and approvals for activities with a significant impact on the environment;

 environmental impact studies and risk assessments concerning the environmental elements.

The list with public authorities holding environmental information and the list with environmental information held by public authorities can be found on the NEPA's webpage. These lists are updated annually.

An electronic database at national level with the projects likely to have significant impact on the environment submitted to the permitting procedure (EIA Database) can also be found on the NEPA's webpage. This database contains information on every step of the permitting procedure, including references on public participation (public announcements, public debates).

(d) With respect to paragraph 4, measures taken to publish and disseminate national reports on the state of the environment;

According to article 23 of GD 878/2005, the public authorities for environmental protection have the obligation to publish annually national, regional or local reports on the state of the environment.

The latest National Report on the State of the Environment - 2006 has been completed in 2007 by NEPA and it's available on its Webpage.

(e) Measures taken to disseminate the information referred to in paragraph 5;

According to article 22 of GD 878/2005, "The information made available and actively disseminated shall be updated and shall include at least:

- text of international treaties, conventions or agreements to which Romania is Party and of local, regional, national or Community legislation on the environment or relating to it:
- policies, plans and programmes relating to the environment;
- progress reports on the implementation of the items referred to in a) and b), when prepared or held in electronic form by public authorities:
- reports on the state of the environment;
- data or summaries of data derived from the monitoring activities affecting or likely to affect the environment
- environmental permits, agreements and authorizations for activities with significant effects on the environment;
- environmental impact studies and risk assessments concerning environmental elements or a reference to the place where the information can be requested or found."

See also the answer to the question on paragraph 3.

(f) With respect to paragraph 6, measures taken to encourage operators whose activities have a significant impact on the environment to inform the public regularly of the environmental impact of their activities and products;

The environmental protection law establishes that:

• the operators have the obligation to ensure the records of the results and to inform the competent environmental authorities on the results of the pollutant emissions self-monitoring and on the threats or the accidents that occurred. The operators have also the obligation to inform the competent authorities and the public, in case of accidental releases of pollutants or major accidents.

• the operators whose activities have a significant impact on the soil or subsoil have the obligation to inform the competent environmental authorities and the other authorities about any accidental situations which put in danger the environment and to operate for the reconstruction of it.

Based on article 26 of GD 878/2005, the operators whose activities have a significant impact on the environment have the obligation to inform the public, 4 times/year, about the environmental consequences of their activities/products by displaying the information on their websites and by other communication tools.

(g) Measures taken to publish and provide information as required in paragraph 7;

The report on the state of the environment is posted yearly on NEPA WebPage and it is available to the public and other authorities who will take into account this information in their development policies and in identifying areas for improvement in the future. MEF and NEPA have promoted leaflets regarding access to environmental information and related access to justice.

Yearly, the National Institute for Statistics issues the Statistical Yearbook which has a special chapter dedicated to geography, meteorology and environment, including information about: natural resources (protected areas, biosphere reservations, national and major natural parks, water resources assured), environment factors quality (ground water quality, trees defoliation), protection measures (investments for environment protection, internal current expenditure for environment protection). This is public information and may be the ground for ministries policies development.

(h) With respect to paragraph 8, measures taken to develop mechanisms with a view to ensuring that sufficient product information is made available to the public;

In the EU Regulation no.761/2001/CE allowing voluntary participation to community scheme of eco-management applies directly into the Romanian legislation. This regulation not only encourages voluntary participation by organizations in a European eco-management and audit schemes, but also promotes the publication of environmental data, including for the production process.

In 2006-2008, Romania, in order to promote EMAS, organized several workshops and distributed posters and leaflets with the main objectives and components of EMAS.

Romania has adopted the Governmental Decision no. 236/2007 on establishing measures in order to ensure the application of the EU Regulation no.1980/2000/CE on eco-labeling. The National Commission for Granting the Eco-label includes 4 representatives from the NGO's sector. In 2007 the eco-label was promoted through mass-media and the promotion campaign included also several workshops in: Bucharest, Cluj, Sibiu, Timişoara, Iaşi, Râmnicu-Vâlcea, Targu-Jiu, Constanta and Ploieşti, and also making easy to read documents such as posters and leaflets.

The latest Action Plan for environmental technologies for 2008-2009 which has been adopted by the Government provides that he eco-label will be further promoted.

The national legal framework for granting eco-labels includes:

- GD no. 236/2007 for establishing measures for ensuring the application of the provisions of the Regulation of European Parliament and Council no. 1980/2000/CE regarding the revised system for granting the Community eco-label.
- OM 830/17.05.2007 on designation of the members of National Commission for Granting Eco-label
- OM 1273/16.08.2007 regarding the approval of the Regulation for organizing the National Commission for Granting the Eco-Label

(i) With respect to paragraph 9, measures taken to establish a nationwide system of pollution inventories or registers.

Romania signed the Protocol on Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers on 21 May 2003 at Kiev, which shall be ratified by law.

MEF issued the MO 1144/2002 on setting up the Register on Pollutant release by activities subject to GEO 152/2006 on Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control (EPER under the IPPC Directive).

Drawn-up by NEPA, the National Pollutant Register-2005 was completed and submitted for approval to the Inter-ministerial Committee for integrating environmental policies into sectorial policies. The pollutant register is available on the NEPA's website.

XII. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 5

12. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of any of the paragraphs of article 5.

The economic operators do not pay sufficient attention to the reporting requirements.

XIII. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 5

13. Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on the collection and dissemination of environmental information in article 5, e.g. are there any statistics available on the information published?

The list with public authorities holding environmental information and the list with environmental information held by public authorities can be found on the NEPA's website (www.anpm.ro). These lists are updated annually.

Each territorial environmental protection agency has on the web site the list with environmental information held by them. The list of environmental information is updated annually.

XIV. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 5

14. Give relevant website addresses, if available:

XV. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY AND OTHER MEASURES IMPLEMENTING THE PROVISIONS ON PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN DECISIONS ON SPECIFIC ACTIVITIES IN ARTICLE 6

- 15. Explain how each paragraph of article 6 has been implemented. Describe the transposition of the relevant definitions in article 2 and the non-discrimination requirement in article 3, paragraph 9. Also, and in particular, describe:
- (a) With respect to paragraph 1, measures taken to ensure that:
- (i) The provisions of article 6 are applied with respect to decisions on whether to permit proposed activities listed in annex I to the Convention;
- (ii) The provisions of article 6 are applied to decisions on proposed activities not listed in annex I which may have a significant effect on the environment;

Art.6 of the Convention refers to environmental decisions/permits for proposed activities listed in annex I of the convention. The Romanian legislation ensured a public participation process since the EIA Directive 85/337/EEC, as amended by 97/11/EC has been transposed in 2002 by GD 918 on the establishment of the EIA framework for certain public and private projects. In 2009, GD 445 was adopted by the Government of Romania.; this normative act enforces all requirements related to public participation in decisions on specific activities as demanded by the Directive 2003/35/EC which incorporates Pillar II of the Aarhus Convention in the Community legislation.

Regarding paragraph 1 of art.6 the Convention:

The EIA national legislation ensures that public participation is a principle which is always implemented whenever the public authority applies the procedure to proposed activities subject to EIA procedure (annex I and II of EIA Directive, as amended).

Public participation is compulsory, as well, when activities are subject to the IPPC procedure for environmental permits (EGO 152/2005, approved by Law 84/2006 and Ministerial Order 818/2003, amended by Order 1158/2005 for approving the issuance of integrated environmental permit establishes the methodology for public participation to the decision making in the integrated environmental permitting procedure).

According to art.8 (1) of the GD 445/2009, this normative act do not apply for projects serving national defense purposes, if the Ministry of Environment and Forests together with the Ministry of National Defense decides, on a case-by-case analyses, that such application would have an adverse effect on the purposes.

The transposition of the relevant definitions in art 2 of the Convention has taken place within art.2 of the GD 445/2009.

According to the national legislation in force, the public participation is part of the regulation procedure for all the projects/activities that might have significant environmental impact.

(b) Measures taken to ensure that the public concerned is informed, early in an environmental decision-making procedure, and in an adequate, timely and effective manner, of the matters referred to in paragraph 2;

Regarding paragraph 2 of art.6 the Convention:

Art. 16, par.(1) of GD445/2009 provides that the public concerned shall have the possibility to participate effectively and early in the environmental impact assessment procedure, to prepare and transmit comments and opinions to the competent authority for environmental authority, when all options are open and before taking the decision to issue/reject the environmental agreement.

Thus, according to art.15 (2) letter a) from GD 445/2009, the competent authorities shall inform the public, by a public announcement and by posting on its own Internet page, early in the environmental impact assessment procedure and at the latest as soon as the information can reasonably be provided, on the following aspects:

- any request for environmental agreement;
- the project is subject of the environmental impact assessment, indicating, where relevant, whether the project is subject to a transboundary EIA;
- contact details of the competent authorities responsible for issuing/rejecting the environmental agreement, those from which relevant information can be obtained, those to which comments or questions can be submitted, and the deadline for transmitting comments or questions;
- the nature of possible decisions or, where there is one, the draft decision;
- an indication of the availability of the information gathered during the scoping stage and the review stage of the EIA Report, including the availability of the EIA Report;
- an indication of the times and places where and means by which the relevant information shall be made available;
- details of the arrangements for public participation made (public hearing, deadlines comments in writing, time and venue of the public hearing,

(c) Measures taken to ensure that the time frames of the public participation procedures respect the requirements of paragraph 3;

The public can participate to the public debate (public hearing) and can send comments. Before the public debate, the public, the project and the EIA Report are made available for a period of 30 working days. During this time, the public may send comments and opinions to the competent environmental authority and to the developer. The project and the EIA Report are subject to a public debate. The public make comments during the public debate. The environmental competent authority is obliged to take into account all public comments received during the procedure, those submitted in writing before the public hearing and of course those expressed during the hearing.

The provisions of MO 135/84/76/1284 from 2009 approving the EIA procedure and for issuing the environmental agreement, meet the requirements on public participation and their time frames.

The legislation in force provides for determined time frames for different public opportunities to participate in the decision-making process.

Order 818/2003 amended by Order 1158/2005 for approving the issuance of integrated environmental permit establishes the methodology for public participation to the decision making in the integrated environmental permitting procedure.

(d) With respect to paragraph 4, measures taken to ensure that there is early public participation;

According to the national legislation in force, the public is informed early in the environmental decision-making process when all the options are opened, starting with the announcement regarding the submitted application.

For projects which require an environmental impact assessment (EIA), this must also include a non-technical summary description of the documents. This ensures that the public has an adequate basis for effective consultation. At this point in time, no decision will have been taken by the competent authority on the project's eligibility for approval.

Following the public notice on the submission of a request for development consent, the public has the possibility to send comments and opinions on the request and the supporting documents.

According to art.9 para.(4) of GD 445/2009 the public is informed about and has the possibility to consult the screening stage decision.

The public concerned is consulted during the scoping stage. The public concerned has the possibility to express comments and opinion on the developer's request and they are taken into consideration in drawing up the scoping report. This report is made available for public information (art.12 para.(3) of GD 445/2009).

The public concerned has also the possibility to consult and to comment on the EIA report (art.14 para.(3) from GD 445/2009: "The EIA report is subject to interested public comments and the proposals/recommendation shall be taken into account in the review stage".

This report is also subject to the public hearing.

The competent authorities publishes the decision to issue/reject the environmental agreement and makes available to the public the content of the agreement (including all the conditions attached thereto), the main reasons and considerations on which the decision to issue/reject is based (including information about the public participation process) and a description, where necessary, of the main measures to avoid, reduce and, if possible, offset the major adverse effects.

Our interpretation is to allow the public concerned to make its contribution when it can influence the environmental assessment of the project. Following the public notice on the submission of a request for development consent, the public has the possibility to send comments and opinions on the request and the supporting documents. The public

involvement in the scoping stage (in order to draw up the scoping report) helps the competent environmental authority in focusing on the most important aspects that need to be assessed from the environmental protection point of view.

The consultation of the public concerned during the review stage contributes to an effective impact assessment of the proposed project. Consequently, the final decision (the decision to issue/reject the environmental agreement) is well grounded and the chances of being challenged are reduced.

(e) With respect to paragraph 5, measures taken to encourage prospective applicants to identify the public concerned, to enter into discussions, and to provide information regarding the objectives of their application before applying for a permit;

The Ministerial Order 863/2002 that approves the EIA guidelines developed by the European Commission recommend that the developers must promote their projects within the public concerned and encourage them to provide project presentations before the application for a final decision/permit. These guidelines are publishes in the Official Journal of Romania (Official Journal no. 52/2003) and are available for developers.

(f) With respect to paragraph 6, measures taken to ensure that:

The environmental report includes information, inter alia, about:

- (i) The competent public authorities give the public concerned all information relevant to the decision-making referred to in article 6 that is available at the time of the public participation procedure;
- (ii) In particular, the competent authorities give to the public concerned the information listed in this paragraph;

As mentioned above the competent public authorities make available to the public concerned all information relevant to the decision-making process. The documentations available to the public contain information about the proposed site, a non-technical summary, the potentially significant effects of the proposed activity on the environment, alternatives studied, etc. In the GD 445/2009 the developers have the obligation to provide the environmental impact assessment report which is public document and it is available for comments to the public.

- A description of the project comprising information on the site, design and size of the project,
- A description of the measures envisaged in order to avoid, reduce and, if possible, remedy significant adverse effects,
- The data required to identify and assess the main effects which the project is likely to have on the environment,
- An outline of the main alternatives studied by the developer and an indication of the main reasons for his choice, taking into account the environmental effects,
- A non-technical summary.

GD 445/2009 provides that early in the environmental impact assessment procedure and at the latest as soon as the information can reasonably be provided, that the environmental impact assessment report shall be made available to the public concerned for comments, whose observations shall be taken into consideration in the review stage. The environmental public authority shall make a public announcement and shall post on its Webpage, the information gathered during the scoping stage and the review stage.

(g) With respect to paragraph 7, measures taken to ensure that procedures for public participation allow the public to submit comments, information, analyses or opinions that it considers relevant to the proposed activity;

The procedures for public participation allow the public to comment, submit information and analyses related to the proposed activities. The public can also participate to the public debates (public hearings) and give opinions that it considers relevant to the proposed activity. The public may submit written opinions in every stage of the EIA procedure and especially comments on the EIA Report may be submitted in order to be discussed in the public debate (public hearing). Such provisions are present in the methodology of the applying the EIA procedure adopted by subsequent legislation.

(h) With respect to paragraph 8, measures taken to ensure that in a decision due account is taken of the outcome of the public participation;

The legislation in force establishes that the competent authorities must take into consideration the outcome of the public participation in the decision-making. EGO no.195/2005 on environmental protection established the principle of public participation in decision-making. It also mentions that specific procedures for public participation will be provided in specials normative acts.

E.g., the Romanian EIA legislation requires that the EIA decision will take into account the outcomes of the consultations and all information obtained in accordance with the procedure.

(i) With respect to paragraph 9, measures taken to ensure that the public is promptly informed of a decision in accordance with the appropriate procedures;

The public is informed of the decision taken by announcements posted on the webpage of the competent authority and of the owner of the project. The announcement contains the text of the decision, including the main reasons and considerations that ground the decision.

The owner of the project makes announcement of the decision taken in national/local newspapers (Ministerial Order 135/84/76/1284 from 2009), while the environmental authority makes announcements on the taken decision, including its content and reasons, on the web page.

Art. 21 (1) of the GD 445/2009 ensures the implementation of the requirement of paragraph 9 of the Convention. On the other hand, this article ensures the transposition of art.9 of the Directive 2003/35/EC.

(j) With respect to paragraph 10, measures taken to ensure that when a public authority reconsiders or updates the operating conditions for an activity referred to in paragraph 1, the provisions of paragraphs 2 to 9 are applied making the necessary changes, and where appropriate;

MO 135/84/76/1284 provides that when the public authority revises a decision taken, public participation is included. Art. 47 provides as follows:

- "(1) Reviewing the screening decision, environmental permit or Natura 2000 approval is done by the issuing environmental authority by taking the following steps:
- [...]
- b) Drawing-up the public announce, in accordance with annex 21;
- c) Publishing the announce on the website and authority's news board;
- d) Sending the public announcement to the project owner in order to be published in the national or local mass-media, its website and the identification board on the investment site
- (k) With respect to paragraph 11, measures taken to apply the provisions of article 6 to decisions on whether to permit the deliberate release of genetically modified organisms into the environment.

Government Emergency Ordinance 43/2007 regarding deliberately introduction on the environment and on the market of genetically modified organisms contains provisions on public information and participation in art. 6 par. (4) and 17.

Government Emergency Ordinance 44/2007 regarding the isolation conditions of the genetically modified organisms, approved by Law no.3/2008, guarantees the information and the consultation of the public in the permitting procedure for the activities using the genetically modified organisms in isolation conditions, in art. 20.

Romania has accepted the GMO amendment to the Aarhus Convention by the adoption of Law no. 24/2008.

XVI. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 6

16. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of any of the paragraphs of article 6.

Sometimes, lack of financial resources may be an obstacle.

XVII. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 6

17. Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on public participation in decisions on specific activities in article 6, e.g. are there any statistics or other information available on public participation in decisions on specific activities or on decisions not to apply the provisions of this article to proposed activities serving national defense purposes.

The public debate (public hearing) is compulsory within the EIA procedure undertaken for projects and takes place in every county (there are 42 counties within Romania). These debates are organized by the local environmental protection agency (EPA) with the support of the developer.

For example, in 2006 there were approximately 600 public debates (public hearings) at national level.

XVIII. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 6

18. Give relevant web site addresses, if available:

XIX. PRACTICAL AND/OR OTHER PROVISIONS MADE FOR THE PUBLIC TO PARTICIPATE DURING THE PREPARATION OF PLANS AND PROGRAMMES RELATING TO THE ENVIRONMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 7

19. List the appropriate practical and/or other provisions made for the public to participate during the preparation of plans and programmes relating to the environment. Describe the transposition of the relevant definitions in article 2 and the non-discrimination requirement in article 3, paragraph 9.

The participation of the public during the preparation of plans and programmes relating to the environment was done by transposing into national law the European Directives 2001/42/EC and 2003/35/EC.

GD 1076/2004 for setting up the environmental assessment procedure of certain plans and programmes transposes the provisions of Directive 2001/42/EC. Public information and participation to the environmental assessment procedure is established in section 4 of the GD 1076/2004.

GD 564/2006 providing for public participation in respect of the drawing up of certain plans and programmes relating to the environment transposed the Directive 2003/35/CE. This governmental decision is issued in application of art.7 of the Aarhus Convention and together with GD 1076/2004 implements the provisions of article 7 of Aarhus Convention.

The GD 564/2006 transposes the definition of the *public* from the Aarhus Convention.

Art. 4 of the GD 564/2006 stipulates that the public participates in an effective way at the decision-making process and has the opportunity to consult the documentation and send comments, questions or opinions before any decision is taken and when all options are open, on the preparation or on the modification or review of a plan or programme. Accordingly to art.5 of GD 546/2006, the public is informed, inter alia, regarding the initiation of the planning process of a plan or programme and the right to participate in the decision-making. Public participation includes a compulsory public debate for the plan/programme subject to this normative act.

Art.9 (1) and (3) of the GD 564/2006 stipulates that the public authority shall take into account the outcome of the public participation and shall inform the public accordingly. Art.2 (2) of the GD 564/2006 provides for the transposition of the non-discrimination requirement as it follows: any natural person without discrimination as to citizenship, nationality and domicile and in case of the legal persons, without discrimination as to where it has its registered seat or effective centre of its activities.

The GD 1076/2004 provides for the definition of the *public* from the Aarhus Convention, as well. The GD 1076/2004 provides that in the consultation process, together with the submission of the plan/programme to the environmental authority, in order to decide if it will undertake the strategic environment assessment, the public is informed by public announcements and has access to the initial version of the plan/programme. This is done, as required by the GD 1076/2004, early, from the beginning of the plan or programme.

Furthermore, the draft plan or programme and environmental report are subject to a public debate (public inquiry). Before the public debate, the public is once again informed by public announcements and has access to the documentation at least 45 days in advance.

Art.2 let. b) defines the environmental assessment as the preparation of environmental report, the consultation of public and of the public authorities concerned by the environmental effects of implementing plans and programmes, taking into account the environmental report and the results of the consultations in decision-making process and the provision of information on the decision.

However, usually the public is more interested in EIA procedure where the level of detail is higher and is easy to understand what are the possible immediate changes within the environment, instead of the SEA procedure which is established for a strategic level and where one has to look into perspectives.

XX. OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN THE PREPARATION OF POLICIES RELATING TO THE ENVIRONMENT PROVIDED PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 7

20. Explain what opportunities there are for public participation in the preparation of policies relating to the environment.

The policies of the Government related to environment are materialized in strategies, plans or programms. These documents are subject to GD 1076/2004 or GD 564/2006.

XXI. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 7

21. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of article 7.

Unawareness of the public on environmental matters due to different reasons: living standard, information means, age, education, professional interest, etc.

XXII. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 7

22. Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on public participation in decisions on specific activities in article 7.

Romania has undertaken the SEA procedure, including public participation phase, for the Sectorial Operational Programme for Environment and other operational programmes, as well (transport, economic competitiveness, regional, fisheries sector).

In the following period there will be produced several strategies related to the environment such as the Strategy against flood, Strategy for the waste sector, which will be subject to public participation, inter alia, in the environmental impact assessment procedure.

XXIII. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 7

23. Give relevant web site addresses, if available:

XXIV. EFFORTS MADE TO PROMOTE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION DURING THE PREPARATION OF REGULATIONS AND RULES THAT MAY HAVE A SIGNIFICANT EFFECT ON THE ENVIRONMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 8

24. Describe what efforts are made to promote effective public participation during the preparation by public authorities of executive regulations and other generally applicable legally binding rules that may have a significant effect on the environment. To the extent appropriate, describe the transposition of the relevant definitions in article 2 and the non-discrimination requirement in article 3, paragraph 9.

Public participation during the preparation of the legislation is accomplished according to the *Law no.52/2003* on decisional transparency in public administration, which stimulates the active participation of citizens to the process of elaboration of normative acts and to the decision-making process.

Law 52/2003 establishes the obligation for public authorities to inform and submit to public debate normative acts, to ensure the access to decision-making process and to the public debate results.

The public authority has the obligation to publish the announcement regarding the drafted normative act on its webpage, to post it at its headquarters and, as appropriate, to send it to the local or central media.

Upon receipt of a request expressed in writing, the public authority sends a copy of the normative act to the citizen concerned.

The announcement must be published at least 30 days in advance of the submission of the normative act to adoption, approval or endorsement.

The public authorities have the obligation to establish a period of at least 10 days for receiving the public comments.

A public debate on the proposed normative act may be organized by the public authority at the request of a least 1 person. Recently, in November 2008, the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development organized a public debate on the project of the normative act that amends the Governmental Emergency Ordinance 195/2005, approved by Law 265/2006.

The MO 1325/2000 on public participation during the preparation of plans, programmes, policies and legislation relating to the environment establishes a dialogue between the public environmental authorities and the NGOs, through a working group.

XXV. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 8

25. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of article 8.

Lack of personnel with juridical training in public institutions;

XXVI. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 8

26. Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on public participation in the field covered by article 8.

Public debates were organized in the consultation process for normative acts such as: public debate for HG 1213/2006 and public debate for EGO 68/2007 on environment liability

XXVII. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 8

27. Give relevant web site addresses, if available:

www.gov.ro, www.mmediu.ro, http://eea.ngo.ro.

XXVIII. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY AND OTHER MEASURES IMPLEMENTING THE PROVISIONS ON ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN ARTICLE 9

28. List legislative, regulatory and other measures that implement the provisions on access to justice in article 9.

Explain how each paragraph of article 9 has been implemented. Describe the transposition of the relevant definitions in article 2 and the non-discrimination requirement in article 3, paragraph 9.

The legislative measures that implement the provisions on access to justice are:

The Romanian Constitution, Law no.554/2004 on administrative contentious, Law 544/2001 on free access to public information, GD 878/2005 on public access to environmental information, GD 445/2009 on establishing the environmental impact assessment framework for certain public and private projects, the Civil Procedure Code.

The Romanian Constitution mentions in art.52 that should any person's rights or legitimate interest be violated by public authority, that person may have recourse to the law courts. Law no.554/2004 on administrative contentious, as amended provides in art.1 that "Any person which considers that one of his/her rights or one of his/her legitimate interests is injured by a public authority, by an administrative act or by the failure to settle a petition within the legal time limit, may address to the law court on administrative contentious, for the annulment of the act, the acknowledgement of the claimed right or of the legitimate interest and the legal redress of the damage caused. The legitimate interest may be both private and public."

GD 878/2005 on public access to environmental information contains provision of access to justice related to environmental information (Pillar one), as follows:

"Art.16(1) Any applicant who considers that his request for environmental information has been unjustified rejected, whether in full or in part, ignored or resolved with an inadequately answer by the public authorities or not dealt with in accordance with the provisions of art. 3-8,

- art.11-15, and of article 29-31, may submit a complaint to the head of the public authority requesting the reassessment of the acts or omissions.
- (2) The complaint provided for in par. (1) is solved according to the provisions of art. 7 of Administrative Contentious Law no 554/2004, published in the Official Journal of Romania, Part I, nr 1154 from December 7, 2004.
- (3) The preliminary administrative procedure provided for in par. (1) is free of charge. ART 17
- (1) The applicant who considers, as a result of the application of the provisions of art. 16 par.
- (1), that maintains an impairment of his/her rights provided for by the present decision, or that it did not receive an answer to his/her complaint within legal timeframe, can bring an action before the competent administrative contentious court of law, where the acts or omissions of the public authorities concerned are reviewed.
- (2) The case is solved according to the provisions of Law no 554/2004.

ART 18

According to the Law no 554/2004, the third person who maintains the impairment of a right or of a legitimate interest as a result of disclosure of the environmental information, can bring an action before the competent administrative contentious court of law.

ART 19

- (1) The final and irrevocable courts' decisions, which admit the applications formulated according to the provisions of Law no 554/2004, represent enforceable titles against public authorities holding the environmental information.
- (2) The decisions of the court of law shall be stated in writing and shall be grounded de facto and de jure."
- GD 445/2009 provides in art.24 (1) that "any person from the interested public and which considers that one of his/her rights or one of his/her legitimate interests is injured may challenge to the law court on administrative contentious, procedurally and substantially, the acts, decisions or omissions of the competent environmental authority which are subject to the public participation in the environmental impact assessment procedure [...]".
- Art.24 (2) stipulates that "any NGO which promotes environmental protection and is legally registered, may address to the law court on administrative contentious [...]".

The relevant provisions on access to justice related to public participation in decisions on specific activities are provided by GD 445/2009, art.24-25, as follows:

- "Art. 24 (1) Any member of the public concerned who maintains an impairment of its rights or of its legitimate interests may file a case before the competent administrative contentious court of law to challenge the substantive and procedural legality of the decisions, acts, actions or omissions subject to public participation, provided for by the present decision, in accordance with the Administrative Contentious Law no. 554/2004, published in the Official Journal of Romania, Part I, no. 1154 of 7 December 2004, as amended.
- (2) Any non-governmental organization meeting the requirements of art. 2 letter i) may file a case before the competent administrative contentious court of law considering that they maintain an impairment of their rights or of their legitimate interests.
- Art. 25 (1) Prior to recourse to the competent administrative contentious court of law the persons referred to in art.23 must request to the hierarchic superior body of the issuing public authority, within 30 days from the date when the screening stage decision or the decision to issue/reject the environmental agreement was made available to the public, to revoke, in whole or in part, the respective decision.
- (2) The hierarchic superior body of the issuing public authority has the obligation to respond to the complaint referred to in paragraph (1) within 30 days from the registration date of the complaint to that authority.
- (3) The preliminary administrative procedure referred to in paragraphs (1) and (2) is free of charge and must be equitable and fair."

The definitions of art.2 regarding *environmental information*, *public authority*, and *public* are transposed by art.2 paragraph (1), (2) and (6) of the GD 878/2005.

The definition on *public concerned* is transposed in art.2 letter i) of the GD 1213/2006.

The non-discrimination requirement was transposed with respect to access to justice related to environmental information in GD878/2005, and related to public participation in GD1213/2006.

Art.2 of the GD 878/2005 provides that the applicant for environmental information may be any natural or legal person requesting environmental information, regardless of its citizenship, nationality or domicile, and in case of the legal persons, regardless of the place where they are registered or where the effective center of their activities is.

Also, and in particular, describe:

- (a) With respect to paragraph 1, measures taken to ensure that:
- (i) Any person who considers that his or her request for information under article 4 has not been dealt with in accordance with the provisions of that article has access to a review procedure before a court of law or another independent and impartial body established by law;

This provision is covered by Law 554/2004 on administrative contentious, as amended, article 1, paragraph (1) – (4), article 7, paragraph (1) – (4), (7).

Art.16 of the GD 878/2005, establishes the right to a review procedure as follows "any applicant who considers that his request for environmental information has been unjustified rejected, whether in full or in part, ignored or resolved with an inadequately answer by the public authorities or not dealt with in accordance with the provisions of art. 3-8, art.11-15, and of articles 29-31, may submit a complaint to the head of the public authority requesting the reassessment of the acts or omissions."

(ii) Where there is provision for such a review by a court of law, such a person also has access to an expeditious procedure established by law that is free of charge or inexpensive for reconsideration by a public authority or review by an independent and impartial body other than a court of law;

The provision can be found in article 7 of *Law 554/2004* on administrative contentious, as amended.

GD 878/2005 provides in art.16 (3) that the preliminary administrative procedure is free of charge.

GD 1213/2006 provides in art.24 (3) that the preliminary administrative procedure is free of charge, equitable and fair.

(iii) Final decisions under this paragraph are binding on the public authority holding the information, and that reasons are stated in writing, at least where access to information is refused;

The national legislation which contains relevant provisions referred to in this item, is the following:

- Law 554/2004 on administrative contentious, article 22, 24, 25
- GD 878/2005, article 19.
- GD 1213/2006, article 23.
- (b) Measures taken to ensure that within the framework of national legislation, members of the public concerned meeting the criteria set out in paragraph 2 have

access to a review procedure before a court of law and/or another independent and impartial body established by law, to challenge the substantive and procedural legality of any decision, act or omission subject to the provisions of article 6;

Law no.554/2004 on administrative contentious, as amended provides in art.1 that "Any person which considers that one of his/her rights or one of his/her legitimate interests is injured by a public authority, by an administrative act or by the failure to settle a petition within the legal time limit, may address to the law court on administrative contentious, for the annulment of the act, the acknowledgement of the claimed right or of the legitimate interest and the legal redress of the damage caused. The legitimate interest may be both private and public."

According to Law 554/2004, the courts of law are competent to rule on the legality of administrative acts, actions or omissions that grounded the issuing of the administrative final decisions.

GD 1213/2006 in art.24, paragraphs 1) and 2) provides access to a review procedure which is called *preliminary administrative procedure*, procedure in compliance as well with the Law 554/2004 on administrative contentious. This *preliminary administrative procedure* is undertaken by the public authority that has issued the decision which is challenged, or is undertaken by a higher public authority.

The GD 1213/2006 for setting up the environmental impact assessment procedure for certain public and private projects (article 23 (1-3), article 24,) provides for the right of the public concerned to address to the competent law courts according to the provisions of Law 554/2004 if they consider that their rights were not respected even after the *preliminary administrative procedure*.

(c) With respect to paragraph 3, measures taken to ensure that where they meet the criteria, if any, laid down in national law, members of the public have access to administrative or judicial procedures to challenge acts and omissions by private persons and public authorities which contravene provisions of national law relating to the environment;

Article 21 (1) of Romanian Constitution, as amended, stipulates that any person can bring a case before a court of law in order to protect his/her rights, freedoms and legitimate interests; *Law 554/2004* on administrative contentious:

- ensures the right of everyone to address to justice for the annulment of the act, recognizing the right demanded or the legitimate interest and repairing the prejudice if they consider that their rights were not respected. The legitimate interest can be private or public (article 1).
- ensures the right to appeal (article 20).

EGO nr. 195/2005 on environmental protection approved by Law 265/2006 stipulates the following:

- the right of any person to submit a request, directly or through the environmental nongovernmental organization, to the administrative and/or judicial authorities, where appropriate, on environmental matters regardless of the occurrence of a damage (art.5 let.d);
- the nongovernmental organizations that promotes the environmental protection have access to justice on environmental matters (art.20 (6))
- (d) With respect to paragraph 4, measures taken to ensure that:
- (i) The procedures referred to in paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 provide adequate and effective remedies;

Law 554/2004 on administrative contentions, as amended, contains provisions on the remedies that may be granted for the damages that have been suffered. The court of law decides on remedies for moral and material damages suffered.

GD 445/2009 provides that the preliminary administrative procedure is free of charge, equitable and fair.

(ii) Such procedures otherwise meet the requirements of this paragraph;

Law 554/2004 on administrative contentions provides specific deadlines and reasonable taxes.

According to the Civil Procedure Code, all court's decisions are rendered in written format and contain *de facto* and *de jure* motives.

(e) With respect to paragraph 5, measures taken to ensure that information is provided to the public on access to administrative and judicial review.

Article 15 of GD 878/2005 provides that in case of refusal of a request for environmental information, the public authorities must provide information about access to justice.

GD 445/2009 provides that the decision on the EIA procedure must include information on the preliminary administrative procedure and judicial procedure.

According to the civil procedure code, the judicial procedures in Romania are public and everyone can be present in the courtroom. Recently the Supreme Council for Magistrates has decided that all the decisions which are public information will be available on the internet, at the WebPages of the law courts.

XXIX. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 9

29. Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of any of the paragraphs of article 9.

Insufficient personnel with juridical training in the environmental protection authorities.

XXX. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 9

30. Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on access to justice pursuant to article 9, e.g. are there any statistics available on environmental justice and are there any assistance mechanisms to remove or reduce financial and other barriers to access to justice?

The administrative review is free of charge and has to be fair, Art. 3.7 from Directive 2003/35 has been transposed in the national legislation in art. 25 (3) of GD 445/2005: "The preliminary administrative procedure referred to in paragraphs (1) and (2) is free of charge and must be equitable and fair".

In case the person is not satisfied by the administrative decision he/she can challenge the decision in contentious law courts. Art. 3 letter m) from Law no. 146/1997 on judicial taxes provided a fee of 4 lei (0,9 Euro) for actions to cancel a decision or to recognise a certain right.

The civil procedure code provides that the persons, who cannot support the judicial cost without prejudicing his/her minimum welfare or her/his family minimum welfare, can request judicial assistance.

Between 2009-2010, the environmental authorities received 105 requests, as follows:

- 50 have been finalised by the authorities;
- 22 have been finalised in law courts;
- 33 are still pending in law courts.

XXXI. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 9

31. Give relevant website addresses, if available:

http://www.just.ro; www.tmb.ro; http://www.tribunalulvrancea.ro/;

www.mmediu.ro; www.anpm.ro;

XXXII. GENERAL COMMENTS ON THE CONVENTION'S OBJECTIVE

32. If appropriate, indicate how the implementation of the Convention contributes to the protection of the right of every person of present and future generations to live in an environment adequate to his or her health and well-being.

The implementation of the Convention assures that a better access to information and public participation in decision-making improve the quality of public authorities' decisions, contribute to the public awareness on environmental matters and promote the ecological education for the purpose of a more profound comprehension of environmental matters.

The provisions of the Aarhus Convention are integrated in the environmental protection legislation and the implementation of those provisions ensures the sustainable development and an environment suitable for public health and well-being.

XXXIII. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY AND OTHER MEASURES IMPLEMENTING THE PROVISIONS ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 6bis AND ANNEX I bis

Concerning legislative, regulatory and other measures that implement the provisions on public participation in decisions on the deliberate release into the environment and placing on the market of genetically modified organisms in article 6 bis, describe:

Romania a acceptat amendamentul privind OMG adus Convenţiei Aarhus prin adoptarea Legii nr.24/2008. Aceste prevederi fac parte din dreptul intern şi iar drepturile publicului pot fi invocate şi revendicate direct, in baza acestui temei legal.

Government Emergency Ordinance 43/2007 regarding deliberately introduction on the environment and on the market of genetically modified organisms contains provisions on public information and participation in art. 6 par. (4) and 17.

Government Emergency Ordinance 44/2007 regarding the isolation conditions of the genetically modified organisms, approved by Law no.3/2008, guarantees the information and the consultation of the public in the permitting procedure for the activities using the genetically modified organisms in isolation conditions, in art. 20.

The Romanian legislation provides that NEPA has the following obligations:

- to consult and inform the public during the decision process, in accordance with the legislation on public access to environmental information;
- to inform the authorities and public involved on the reviewing, withdrawal of an authorisation/permit, or any accidents.

The authorisation process of OMG activities in isolation conditions is public. The notification is published on the website. Within a deadline of 30 days the public can submit proposals or comments. For OMG activities class 3 and 4, the authorities organise public debates. As consequence, the authority draws-up a report. OMG information is considered environmental information and is subject to public access, in accordance with GD 878/2005.

The authorities cannot consider confidential information, the following:

- general characteristic of OMG;
- details of the operator;
- location and usage purpose;
- isolation conditions usage class and bio security measures;
- risk assessment;
- emergency plan.

XXXIV. OBSTACLES ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 6bis AND ANNEX I bis

Describe any obstacles encountered in the implementation of any of the paragraphs of article 6 bis and annex I bis.

XXXV. FURTHER INFORMATION ON THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE 6bis AND ANNEX I bis

Provide further information on the practical application of the provisions on public participation in decisions on the deliberate release into the environment and placing on the market of genetically modified organisms in article 6 bis, e.g. are there any statistics or other information available on public participation in such decisions or on decisions considered under paragraph 2 of annex I bis to be exceptions to the public participation procedures in that annex?

Ministerial Order 1205/2009 on the elaborations and functioning of the National Register on the OMG locations ensures public information in an organised manner. The register is a database, in electronic and format paper, which ensures yearly statistic of OMG locations. The Register is published on the NEPA's website.

Important information can be found on NGO website. For instance, in Cluj-Napoca, the Centre for OMG information – InfOMG has been established. This NGO monitories OMG cultivation and distribution process in Romania and EU, together with governmental decision on this matter.

XXXVI. WEBSITE ADDRESSES RELEVANT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 6bis

Give relevant website addresses, if available, including website addresses for registers of decisions and releases related to genetically modified organisms:

MEF

http://www.mmediu.ro/legislatie/biosecuritate.htm

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development http://www.madr.ro/pages/page.php?sub=0121&self=01

Centrul OMG http://www.infomg.ro/web/ro/

NEPA

The register

http://www.anpm.ro/registrul_privind_locatiile_pentru_introducerea_deliberata_in_mediu_pentru_testare_a_organismelor_modificate_genetic_in_anul_2009-208